

The Partition: 1947, Was it Jinnah or Nehru?

Sheetal Kumrawat
Student

Indore Institute of Law, Indore, Madhya Pradesh

Abstract - 1947 The year when two nations got separated that were India and Pakistan. The Partition which was designed to get political and social benefit which lead to the most horrifying Act ever seen in the history of India which lead to various rapes and more than a million deaths in various parts of the country. The main leaders involved in partition were Mahatma Gandhi, Nehru and Jinnah People state various reasons of the separation but no one exactly knows the reason why the two nations were separated. Some people consider that Nehru was greedy for power but some think that it was Jinnah who wanted a separate nation. The paper mainly deals with the circumstance that arose and lead to the partition and who was responsible for the partition Jinnah or Nehru.

1.

2. Introduction

On 15 August 1947 the nation finally turned independent after being ruled for 200 years by British Raj. While the whole world in 1940's was annihilating by war here in India the three leaders Mohandas Karamchand Gandhi, Jawaharlal Nehru and Muhammad Ali Jinnah were indulged in making the constitution of a new Independent India. This was only made possible by the continuous efforts and hard work of the leaders of India. When everything was going well then, what was the reason that the need of partition arose, many historians said that it was the hunger of congress for the power which lead to the separation of India and Pakistan. Gandhi among these leader was the only idealist who wanted an undivided nation. The British negotiated with Jinnah who was the leader of Muslim league they said that Muslims being the minors will lose their rights and separation was the only way to protect their rights. On the other side Jawaharlal Nehru also went along the decision of separating the to countries on the basis of religion.

3. Objectives

Who was responsible for partition of India and Pakistan? Was it Jinnah or Nehru?

4. Beginning of separation of two religions

By the late 19th century the people of India got tired of British rule which lead to the evolution of one of the most powerful parties The Indian National Congress. This party was mainly created to reforms in the British parliament. By the 20th century the britishers try to give more power to congress but till that time they wanted the nation to be independent and a complete self-government to stop these actions British government introduced laws which were restricting the rights of the nationalist groups and even the rights of the public of India. Due to this action the Indian National congress got a really strong support of people. In 1920's with the leadership of Mahatma the revolutionary group became really forbidding power. And also the Muslim community starting feeling bitter as the Hindus have gained the political hold. This lead to the separation of Muslim from congress in the protest against religion. And on 30th December 1906 the Muslim community created its nationalist party the Muslim league. By 1910 there were two completely different communities which fought amongst each other and even against the British Raj. But the aim to create this league was not to demand a separate nation but to protect their rights and interest and to respectfully represent their needs and wants to the government. but with the increase in the chances of getting freedom the league developed a sort of fear in their mind which was *ipso facto* Hindu rule. [1]

After the swadeshi movement there were various reforms, the reform of 1909 brought lot of changes in the field of administration which was known as the Monte-milo reforms. At this point of time the Sir Agha Khan as leader of Muslim league demanded a separate electorate of Muslims

During the second phase when the congress decided that the motive of the struggle should be *Purina Swaraj* - which means complete independence.

4. The Calcutta session of the All India Muslim League

This letter concerns the breakdown of the Gandhi-Jinnah talks held in September 1944. The discussions depended on the Muslim League's interest for Pakistan. They finished without understanding, as clarified in this concentrate. The Rajagopalachari equation specified was advanced by Chakravarty Rajagopalachari in 1943. It expressed that the Muslim League was to back the Indian interest for freedom and to co-work with Congress in the development of a temporary between time government for a transitional period. Once the Second World War had finished, a commission was to be selected for delineating areas in the Northwest and east of India where the Muslim populace was in the lion's share. A vote would then be taken of the considerable number of tenants in the said zones to choose the issue of partition from Hindustan

In the year 1927 the Indian Muslim league decided to draft the constitution of India along with Indian national congress. In this sitting the league put forth some proposal. the important proposal was to separate Sindh and Baluchistan which was not recognized. In the month of February, May and August 1928 there was a conference organized for all the parties which was

named as the “*Nehru Report*” this report rejected the principle of separate electorate which was made as a proposal by the League and also made the reservation in the states where the Muslims were minor but even here Jinnah refused the report and introduced the “*Fourteen points*”.

The Fourteen Points [2]

1. Government System

The type without bounds constitution ought to be government with the residuary forces rested in the areas.

2. Common Autonomy

A uniform measure of self-governance will be allowed to all areas.

3. Portrayal of Minorities

All administrative in the nation and other chose bodies will be constituted on the positive standards of sufficient and successful portrayal of minorities in each territory without decreasing the greater part in any area to a minority or even uniformity.

4. Number of Muslim Representative

In the focal administrative, Muslims delegate will be at the very least 33%.

5. Isolante Electorats

Illustrative of public gatherings will keep on being by methods for isolated electorates as at exhibit gave it will be available to any network, whenever to surrender its different electorate for joint electorate.

6. Muslim Majority Provinces

Any regional re-conveyance that may whenever be vital will not at all, influence the Muslim larger part in Punjab, Bengal and N.W.F.P.

7. Religious Liberty

Full religious Liberty, freedom of conviction, love and recognition, affiliation and training will be ensured to all the correspondence.

8. Three-Fourth Representation

No bill or determination will be passed in any authoritative or some other chose body if three-fourths of the individuals from any network in that specific body contradict such a bill.

9. Partition of Sindh

Sindh ought to be isolated from Bombay Presidency.

10. Presentation of Reforms in N.W.F.P and Baluchistan

Changes ought to be presented in the North-West Frontier Province and Baluchistan on an indistinguishable balance from in different areas.

11. Taxpayer driven organizations

Muslims ought to be given satisfactory offer alongside different Indians in the administrations of State.

12. Insurance of Muslim's way of life and Language

The constitution should epitomize satisfactory shield for the assurance of Muslim culture, dialect, religion and human progress.

13. One-Third Muslim Ministers

No bureau, either focal or commonplace be formed. Without being an extent of no less than 33% Muslim Ministers.

14. Constitution

No change will be made in the constitution of state aside from with the simultaneousness of State constituting the Indian Federation.

Even after so many conflicts among the Hindus and Muslims there was no such intention or remembrance of having a separate homeland of Muslims. The idea of separate home land was laid down by one of the poet named Muhammad Iqbal

5. Role of Muhammad Iqbal in laying the concept of separate home land

Dr. Allama Muhammad Iqbal is considered to be embodied with philosopher king, revolutionary poet, visionary learning and even the one who inspired the Pakistan movement. In Allahabad he founded a concept of “Two Nations Theory” which awakened the feeling of nationality in the Muslims. The philosophy laid was named as the “Tasawwar- e- Ummah”. Iqbal's belief system, Quaid-e-Azam said that we are a country with our own particular culture and development, dialect and writing, craftsmanship and engineering, names and terminology, feeling of qualities and extent, legitimate laws and good code, customs and date-book, history and custom, aptitudes and aspirations, to put it plainly, we have our own particular unmistakable point of view and of-life”, Sultan Zahoor additionally said.[3]

6. 16th August 1946

The Great Calcutta Killing

The actual violence began on 16 August 1946 which is known as the “Direct Action Day” or the “Great Calcutta Killings”. Bengal at that time had a mixed population of Hindus and Muslims which is known to be designed by the Muslim League which belonged to Jinnah this was the first step taken to separate the two nations. The league, Jinnah said, wanted “either a divided India or a Destroyed India”.¹ the revolt turned into retaliation in Bihar and slowly spread across Delhi.

The inconveniences began on the morning of the August 16. Shops were mightily shut. Wounding, tossing of stones and brickbats began. At 12 O'clock, the League's rally started, which was the biggest ever Muslim get together in Bengal. The Muslims from all sides of Calcutta with Iron Bars and machines began congregating and this was trailed by a Namaz at 2.00 PM. Here some addresses were made by Khawaja Nazimuddin and Suhrawardy. This was trailed by across the board revolts in Calcutta. The uproars before long spread to all parts of North India and it transformed into a Civil War amongst Hindus and Muslims. [6]

7. On 28th September 1948

Gandhi -Jinnah talks

As Gandhi was against the division of Pakistan and India on the other hand Jinnah construct himself in light of the "two countries" hypothesis, as indicated by which the Muslims and Hindus in India, anyway they might be dispersed over the nation, are totally unfamiliar to each other. He squeezed Gandhi to acknowledge this hypothesis and the Muslim League's Lahore Resolution of March 1940 which he viewed as an outflow of it. He made it unmistakable that his sovereign Muslim States must be made generously out of the British Indian Provinces currently viewed as Muslim (e.g., in the north-west; Sind, Baluchistan, the North-West Frontier Province and the Punjab, and in the north-east, Assam and Bengal). The privilege of these zones to self-assurance and separate power was to be practiced by their Muslim occupants alone. Jinnah declined to answer unbalanced inquiries concerning monetary security and the destiny of minorities. He disclosed to Gandhi that he was managing just with British India and was not thinking about the Indian States. Contending from the "two countries" hypothesis, he couldn't consent to any cooperation between the Hindus and the Muslims with a specific end goal to accomplish freedom, or to any temporary Government before the Muslim assert had been at long last settled. Relations between Muslim India and Hindu India would be settled by arrangement as amongst autonomous and sovereign States, and there could be no doubt of any Central Government or protected connection.

8. A Note by Nehru to Mountbatten,1947

Lord Mountbatten was the one who decided the areas which will be in India and Which will be in Pakistan. When Nehru and Lord Mountbatten were staying in Shimla he showed a plan to Nehru. Nehru was totally against the plan he said that the plan might lead to "Balkanisation" of India. Until now all British proposition and for sure the sum total of what discourses have been basically on a United India, the in streets into such solidarity being restricted either to debilitating the Centre and giving a type of Group self-sufficiency or to give the flexibility to specific territories, which are obviously against joining the Union, to make themselves into discrete States. The Cabinet Mission thought about each part of a completely separated India and rejected it. Those contemplations stay unaltered and undoubtedly the turmoil and viciousness of late months add additionally weight to those contemplations.

It must be recollected that the British Cabinet design was acknowledged by all in India with the sole special case of the Muslim League and even the League had not under any condition times rejected it. Indeed, even today the League is arranged and keeps on procuring such favorable circumstances as it acquired for itself by joining the Interim Government based on acknowledgment of the arrangement. The tossing over the edge of the arrangement as well as the entirety of its fundamental originations in particular the all-India Union and common autonomy to the most extreme inside that Union has all the earmarks of being absolutely at the example of one gathering alone in India. The Muslim League vetoes the arrangement and His Majesty's Government, thusly, toss it over the edge. This progression can just affirm the conviction broadly held that no arrangement of His Majesty's Government will expect to remember. To incite certain common clash and to add to viciousness and confusion, to a further breakdown of the focal expert which alone can keep the turmoil that is developing, to dishearten the armed force, the police and the Central Services. The suggestion that every one of the successor States is to close autonomous arrangements, probably with His Majesty's Government additionally, which take after if the all-India Union is dismissed as a premise and sway returns to the Provinces, is probably going to make many "Ulster's" in India. [4]

Minutes of a meeting held at Government House, New Delhi, 16 August 1947, to receive the awards of the Boundary Commissions which demarcated the boundaries between India and Pakistan in Bengal and the Punjab.

The Indian leaders display at this gathering to consider the honors of the Boundary Commissions were extremely expressing the honors. The Chittagong Hill Tracts specifically were passionate. These had a substantial Hindu greater part and Nehru subsequently contended for them to end up some portion of India. Be that as it may, the Tracts were viewed as having a cozy physical and financial relationship with East Bengal and no legitimate correspondence joins with Assam, in this manner Sir Radcliffe granted them to Pakistan. The Punjab was another region of question. Sikhs made up an extensive extent of the populace around there and had essential authentic and religious relationship with it.

Mountbatten needs additionally to be governor general of Pakistan, and he welcomes Jinnah to the yards of his home to welcome him. Jinnah decays on the grounds that his Muslim League has picked him. "You understand, Mr. Jinnah, that this will cost you dear," Mountbatten lets him know. "It will cost you the fate of Pakistan, everything. You won't have a wooden table or seat in an office in your Pakistan. Or on the other hand the cash to purchase an olive green armed force water container." And so the infuriated Mountbatten denies Pakistan of Ferozepur and Kashmir and declines to shield Muslims from killings.

A note is conveyed to Jinnah that the Maharaja of Kashmir has marked promotion to India. Jinnah studies it indignantly through his monocle. "Kashmir is a Muslim state," he says. "Kashmir is the jugular vein of Pakistan."

This discussion, indicating at some facts with ongoing suggestion too goes into the making of history. When Mountbatten gave him a suggestion of giving the Prime Minister seat to Jinnah.

Edwina: "The nation could never forgive you (if Jinnah moved toward becoming PM)."

At last Nehru, who emphatically restricts the establishment of Jinnah as PM, reconsiders his situation to maintain a strategic distance from a segment. He is at a group table with Edwina and Mountbatten. Edwina stops him: "You should be leader of India. Giving endlessly Pakistan is the main way...don't begin losing strength at this point." Mountbatten proposes he will bring the date for Partition forward by eight months. "Pakistan should scramble against itself, truly." In such a large number of ways, it was them three.

9. Nehru's opinion on partition

Gandhi saw most issues, and embraced his position, from an ethical system. Conversely, different Congress stalwarts of the time, especially Nehru and Sardar Patel, paid more prominent emphasis to necessities of realpolitik. As an outcome, it has been fairly simple to paint the twosome as eager for power men restless to get political power. For individuals holding this perspective, it has been anything but difficult to consider Nehru as much in charge of the segment, or possibly to a lesser degree, as Mohammed Ali Jinnah. Truth be told, scarcely complete a couple of years pass by without another creator or student of history concocting 'new certainties' to set up Nehru's complicity, or its nonattendance.

However, Nehru's first reaction to the Mountbatten Plan, which excited the procedure to freedom, can't be disregarded. "It is with no happiness in my heart that I compliment these proposition," he expressed to his gathering associates. Truth be told, as on most events, one can't, however, be moved by the tone and tenor of his acknowledgment of the inescapable. He started on a solemn note helping party pioneers to remember nine months (starting with the arrangement of the Interim Government in September 1946) of "preliminary and trouble, of uneasiness and now and again even of deplorability."

Nehru additionally attracted regard for the Mountbatten Plan as "a declaration for the British government" and clarified it obtusely as one which sets out "a methodology of self-assurance in specific territories of India." Yet Nehru likewise underlined the positive side of the improvement by featuring that the Viceroy's presentation "guarantees a major progress towards finish autonomy". [5]

Without mincing his words, Nehru said he had "no uncertainty" in his mind "this is the correct course." Yet he didn't conceal his sadness in light of the fact that "for ages we have envisioned and battled for a free and autonomous joined India. The proposition to enable certain parts to surrender, on the off chance that they so will, is excruciating for any of us to think about... The assembled India we have worked for was not one of impulse and intimidation but rather a charge and willing relationship of a free people... We are little men serving incredible causes, but since the reason is awesome something of that enormity falls upon us moreover."

10. Observation

The Partition was the biggest thing to happen to a united nation where all Hindus, Muslims, Sikh and Christians live with harmony. Hindus and Muslims fought many fights during the British era together but the consequences were such which lead to the demand of a separate nation by the Indian Muslim League. The main toxin attacked in the mind of various Muslims that being a minority in the country they will not be given proper rights and will be ill-treated. This problem was put forward by Jinnah being a leader he wanted his Muslim brothers to be so that they could live a free life and another suggestion was to make him the Prime Minister of India. When Gandhi and Nehru were called for the meeting, Gandhi straight away said denied the partition as he always dreamt of an Independent and United Nation.

Jinnah introduced 14 points in the Calcutta sessions which mentioned the rights of the Muslims these were denied by Nehru in "Nehru Report" but there were some rights preserved for the Muslims in the community. Secondly He wanted the whole Nation or a separate nation giving the nation in hands of a person belonging to minorities was not a problem but as mentioned by Nehru India will be a democratic country and most of the Majority would not vote Jinnah which might lead to another conflict. Jinnah even mentioned that Gandhi and Nehru never followed the advice given by Jinnah hence he thought when the country will be Independent then Minorities of the country will not be treated equal.

On the other hand, Nehru agreed to the partition but various lines which he said to Mountbatten clearly indicate that he was totally against the partition the lines were "It is with no happiness in my heart that I compliment these proposition," "for ages we have envisioned and battled for a free and autonomous joined India. The proposition to enable certain parts to surrender, on the off chance that they so will, is excruciating for any of us to think about...clearly tell us that he was not power hungry.

Accordingly, no one can be blamed for Partition as Jinnah on his side wanted to make sure that his Muslim brothers could have all rights which they deserve but on the other side Nehru wanted the nation to be democratic and making Jinnah directly PM without elections was against democracy and due to revolts arising in the country it was really necessary to take some action and no time was there to search an alternative way. Hence no one can be specifically blamed for the partition.

11. Conclusion

The division in light of fringes made by the British toward the finish of their provincial govern became effective at the stroke of midnight on the eve of Aug 14, 1947. It was not easy for India to get independence and millions of people sacrificed their lives just to get Independent but even till Independence this suffering didn't ended 15 million Muslims, Hindus and Sikhs, dreading separation, swapped nations in a change that cost in excess of a million lives again.[7] Amid the turbulent progress, prepare autos brimming with bodies touched base at railroad stations in the twin urban areas of Lahore and Amritsar in the region of Punjab, which was divided generally into equal parts. No less than a million kicked the bucket along the way, the rest filling rank camps raised in urban communities as of now pushed to the verge by savagery, plundering and sustenance deficiencies.

Today, the two nations India and Pakistan stay disabled by the accounts worked around recollections of the wrongdoings of Partition, as lawmakers and the military keep on stoking the abhorrence's of 1947 for their own particular finishes. Nisid Hajari closes his book by pointing out that the contention amongst India and Pakistan "is getting all the more, as opposed to less, risky: the two nations' atomic arms stockpiles are developing,

aggressor bunches are winding up abler, and crazy media outlets on the two sides are contracting the degree for direct voices." Moreover, Pakistan, atomic equipped and profoundly unsteady, isn't a danger just to India; it is currently the world's concern, the epicenter of a significant number of the present most disturbing security dangers. It was out of madrassas in Pakistan that the Taliban developed. That administration, which was then the most retrograde in present day Islamic history, if asylum to Al Qaeda's initiative even after 9/11. [10]

It is hard to differ with Hajari's decision: "It is well past time that the beneficiaries to Nehru and Jinnah at long last put 1947's extreme anger to rest."

References

- [1]Independent - <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/asia/search-for-the-real-villain-of-partition-divides-india-again-1773486.html>
- [2] Indian Independence Day: everything you need to know about Partition between India and Pakistan 70 years on - <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2017/08/15/indian-independence-day-everything-need-know-partition-india/>
- [3] EDGE -(A History of the Conflict between India and Pakistan with Intervention from the United Nations) https://web.stanford.edu/class/e297c/war_peace/confrontation/hintervention.html
- [4] The New York Times -The 'Tryst With Destiny' Speech That Divided India and Pakistan)<https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/projects/cp/obituaries/archives/india-pakistan>
- [5] Indian Independence: Partition of India and Pakistan-<https://www.bl.uk/reshelp/findhelpregion/asia/india/indianindependence/indiapakistan/partition5/index.html>
- [6] Past Continuous: Those Who Think Nehru Was Power Hungry Should Review Events Leading to Independence (21 July 2018, 8:21 PM) <https://thewire.in/history/past-continuous-nehru-independence>
- [7] Times of India
- [8] Anil Dharker, India at 70: Horror of Partition sealed nears drive for a secular democratic (19 July 2018 , 5:30 PM) https://www.independent.co.uk/news/long_reads/lahore-anil-dharker-radcliff-line-partition-pakistan-memories-punjab-bengal-nehru-gandhi-a7887711.html.
- [9] Partition 1947- https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=E4hhjh3_fMc
- [10] Indian Independence Day: everything you need to know about Partition between India and Pakistan 70 years on - <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2017/08/15/indian-independence-day-everything-need-know-partition-india/>
- [11] The Great Divide, The violent legacy of Indian Partition. By William Dalrymple - <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2015/06/29/the-great-divide-books-dalrymple>